Case 1:14-cr-00068-KBF Document 232-4 Filed 04/16/15 Page 1 of 19

EXHIBIT 4

Immigration and Customs Enforcement (ICE) Homeland Security Investigations (HSI) Chicago Electronic Crimes Task Force (ECTF) is conducting an investigation into the seizures of small quantities of drugs being made at the Customs and Border Protection (CBP) International Mail Branch (IMB) at Chicago O'Hare Airport. These seizures have been linked to anonymous online marketplace called the Silk Road. This investigation is focused on identifying and dismantling the Silk Road website as well as identifying the sellers and recipients of the Scheduled Controlled Substances, as well as the anabolic and synthetic drugs being sold on the website.

This report contains information pertaining to Anand ATHAVALE's suspected role as the Silk Road Administrator the Dread Pirate Roberts.

DETAILS OF INVESTIGATION:

Since September of 2011, Immigration and Customs Enforcement (ICE) Homeland Security Investigations (HSI) Chicago Electronic Crimes Task Force (ECTF) has been investigation the anonymous online black market referred to as the Silk Road. Since March of 2011, the Silk Road has hosted users that are able to buy and sell illegal drugs, counterfeit commercial merchandise, false identification documents and other illegal goods from destinations all over the world. Since early 2012, the operator and main administrator of the Silk Road website has utilized the screen name the "Dread Pirate Roberts"; prior to that the administrator used the screen name "Silk Road."

Since June of 2011, the Silk Road has maintained two independent websites. The first is its marketplace where it sells all of the illicit goods. The other is an online forum where the users can openly discuss anything related to the marketplace as well as receive updates from the Silk Road administrators concerning outages or maintenance on the marketplace website.

The Silk Road administrator has remained active on the Silk Road forum since its creation by posting messages to its other members.

On June 18, 2011, the Silk Road administrator posted their first message that stated the following.

"Hey gang,

Really sorry for the dead time there. Hopefully most of you got the message on the bitcoin forum or at silkroadmarket.org. The only major change is this forum. We have it running on a separate server with it's own url so if the main site ever goes down again, first check here for updates. Unfortunately this means we have separate logins for the main site and the forum.

As we mentioned before, everything was backed up and totally restored, but if for some reason a deposit didn't make it in to your account or something like that, just let us know and we'll track it down and credit you. Also, we're giving everyone a 4 day grace period on taking orders to the resolution center before they are auto-resolved, so sellers, you may see some orders past due for a few days.

Thanks everyone for hanging in there with us. This work is scary and exciting all at the same time, and I'm really very happy to be on this journey with all of you.

Cheers, Silk Road staff"

On February 05, 2012, the Silk Road administrator changed their screen name to the Dread Pirate Roberts (DPR) as a result of a contest held on the forum. The message of the change read as follows, "technically noisebr0 was the last poster, but who is noisebr0??? Most likely a profile made by a cheating bot! The winner is MagicMan!!! Congrats MM! Thanks everyone else for playing. I hope you like my new name) Messages - Dread Pirate Roberts"

On March 20, 2012, DPR posted a message on the forum that gave some insight into their motivations. The message read as follows.

"Hey gang,

I read more than I post in the forum, and my posts are rarely of a personal nature. For some reason the mood struck me just now to put the revolution down for a minute and just express a few things. There is a curtain of anonymity and secrecy that covers everything that goes on behind the scenes here. It is often fast paced and stressful behind this curtain and I rarely lift my head long enough to take in just how amazing all of this is. But when I do I am filled with inspiration and hope for the future. Here's a little story about what inspires me:

For years I was frustrated and defeated by what seemed to be insurmountable barriers between the world today and the world I wanted. I searched long and hard for the truth about what is right and wrong and good for humanity. I argued with, learned from, and read the works of brilliant people in search of the truth. It's a damn hard thing to do too with all of the misinformation and distractions in the sea of opinion we live in.

But eventually I found something I could agree with whole heartedly. Something that made sense, was simple, elegant and consistent in all cases. I'm talking about the Austrian Economic theory, voluntaryism, anarcho-capitalism, agorism etc. espoused by the likes of Mises and Rothbard before their deaths, and Salerno and Rockwell today.

From their works, I understood the mechanics of liberty, and the effects of tyranny. But such vision was a curse. Everywhere I looked I saw the State, and the horrible withering effects it had on the human spirit. It was horribly depressing. Like waking from a restless dream to find yourself in a cage with no way out. But I also saw free spirits trying to break free of their chains, doing everything they could to serve their fellow man and provide for themselves and their loved ones. I saw the magical and powerful wealth creating effect of the market, the way it fostered cooperation, civility and tolerance. How it made trading partners out of strangers or even enemies. How it coordinates the actions of every person on the planet in ways too complex for any one mind to fathom to produce an overflowing abundance of wealth, where nothing is wasted and where power and responsibility are directed to those most deserving and able. I saw a better way, but knew of no way to get there.

I read everything I could to deepen my understanding of economics and liberty, but it was all intellectual, there was no call to action except to tell the people around me what I had learned and hopefully get them to see the light. That was until I read "Alongside night" and the works of Samuel Edward Konkin III.

At last the missing puzzle piece! All of the sudden it was so clear: every action you take outside the scope of government control strengthens the market and weakens the state. I saw how the state lives parasitically off the productive people of the world, and how quickly it would crumble if it didn't have it's tax revenues. No soldiers if you can't pay them. No drug war without billions of dollars being siphoned off the very people you are oppressing.

For the first time I saw the drug cartels and the dealers, and every person in the whole damn supply chain in a different light. Some, especially the cartels, are basically a defacto violent power hungry state, and surely would love nothing more than to take control of a national government, but you average joe pot dealer, who wouldn't hurt a fly, that guy became my hero. By making his living outside the purview of the state, he was depriving it of his precious life force, the product of his efforts. He was free. People like him, little by little, weakened the state and strengthened the market.

It wasn't long, maybe a year or two after this realization that the pieces started coming together for the Silk Road, and what a ride it has been. No longer do I feel ANY frustration. In fact I am at peace in the knowledge that every day I have more I can do to breath life into a truly revolutionary and free market than I have hours in the day. I walk tall, proud and free, knowing that the actions I take eat away at the infrastructure that keeps oppression alive.

We are like a little seed in a big jungle that has just broken the surface of the forest floor. It's a big scary jungle with lots of dangerous creatures, each honed by evolution to survive in the hostile environment known as human society. All manner of corporation, government agency, small family businesses, anything that can gain a foothold and survive.

But the environment is rapidly changing and the jungle has never seen a species quite like the Silk Road. You can see it, but you can't touch it. It is elusive, yet powerful, and we are evolving at a rapid clip, experimenting, trying to find sturdy ground we can put roots down in.

Case 1:14-cr-00068-KBF Document 232-4 Filed 04/16/15 Page 5 of 19

Will we and others like us someday grow to be tall hardwoods? Will we reshape the landscape of society as we know it? What if one day we had enough power to maintain a physical presence on the globe, where we shunned the parasites and upheld the rule of law, where the right to privacy and property was unquestioned and enshrined in the very structure of society. Where police are our servants and protectors beholden to their customers, the people. Where our leaders earn their power and responsibility in the harsh and unforgiving furnace of the free market and not from behind a gun, where the opportunities to create and enjoy wealth are as boundless as one's imagination.

Some day, we could be a shining beacon of hope for the oppressed people of the world just as so many oppressed and violated souls have found refuge here already. Will it happen overnight? No. Will it happen in a lifetime? I don't know. Is it worth fighting for until my last breath. Of course. Once you've seen what's possible, how can you do otherwise? How can you plug yourself into the tax eating, life sucking, violent, sadistic, war mongering, oppressive machine ever again? How can you kneel when you've felt the power of your own legs?

Felt them stretch and flex as you learn to walk and think as a free person? I would rather live my life in rags now than in golden chains. And now we can have both! Now it is profitable to throw off one's chains, with amazing crypto technology reducing the risk of doing so dramatically. How many niches have yet to be filled in the world of anonymous online markets? The opportunity to prosper and take part in a revolution of epic proportions is at our fingertips!

I have no one to share my thoughts with in physical space. Security does not permit it, so thanks for listening. I hope my words can be an inspiration just as I am given so much by everyone here.

Dread Pirate Roberts"

On DPR's Silk Road forum profile page and on every post he/she creates is a signature. Since the HSI Chicago investigation began, HSI Special Agent (SA) Jared Der-Yeghiayan has observed that DPR's signature has been modified with new quotes and links several times. SA Der-Yeghiayan has noted that there have been several quotes similar to the beliefs posted in the message above by DPR. SA Der-Yeghiayan also recalls that DPR's signature has consistently contained a link to various books or publications from the website mises.org.

Mises.org is a website in support of the Ludwig von Mises institute founded in 1982 in Auburn, Alabama, and is dedicated to, "the research and educational center of classical liberalism, libertarian political theory, and the Austrian School of economics."

In July of 2012, HSI SA Der-Yeghiayan began researching the Mises.org website and discovered their online forum. SA Der-Yeghiayan then took note of multiple unusual or repetitive words/sayings made by DPR on the SR forum and began to search for them on the Mises.org forum.

Case 1:14-cr-00068-KBF Document 232-4 Filed 04/16/15 Page 6 of 19

While searching the Mises.org forums SA Der-Yeghiayan took note of one individual using the screen name liberty student (LS). LS was an administrator on the Mises.org forums and had made 11,343 posts as early as 2009.

In October of 2012, HSI Baltimore office provided SA Der-Yeghiayan with a file containing all of the Undercover (UC) chats made between a UC Agent and DPR.

The following is a list of the similarities in use of words or statements made by LS on the mises.org forums in comparison to messages posted by DPR on the Silk Road forums and a few from Undercover chats with DPR provided by HSI Baltimore.

-Both spells Labor as "Labour" occasionally, and as "Labor" other times

Posted by DPR on October 03, 2012:

"That work is an opportunity for them to better themselves. Child labour regulations only hampered the development and expansion of the industries that were providing these opportunities."

Posted by LS on April 15, 2009:

"The free market supports everyone's self interest by the right to own your own property and to keep the fruits of your own labour."

-Both use and spell the word "real-time"

Posted by DPR on July 27, 2011:

"We don't do it in real-time to avoid using up alot of system resources."

Posted by LS on August 01, 2009:

"Wikipedia is about the political power of editors, not the capacity for anyone to edit information in real-time"

-Both use the word "lemme"

UC Chat by DPR:

"lemme find a good comp for ya"

Posted by LS on May 25, 2009:

"Lemme guess. You didn't consider that when you make those statements."

-Both frequently end sentences with ", right"

Posted by DPR on July 22, 2012:

"The current sig is ok though, right?"

Case 1:14-cr-00068-KBF Document 232-4 Filed 04/16/15 Page 7 of 19

Posted by LS on October 23, 2010:

"And by rightful owners, you mean people who can prove title, right?"

-Both spell route as "rout"

Posted by DPR on October 01, 2012:

"It will be shut down quickly and the land put to better use leaving the two better routs to serve the demand."

Posted by LS on May 11, 2009:

"It should be a bigger rout than the takedown of Chris Peden last year."

-Both use the term "intellectual laziness"

Posted by DPR on May 03, 2012:

"To look at the hard examples, you have to abandon intellectual laziness and apply market principles to industries where the market has not been allowed to work because of government monopoly (education, transportation, utilities, security, justice, defense, charity etc)."

Posted by LS on August 04, 2009:

"If you are going to assume gaps (real or perceived) without asking in good faith for clarification (which I consider unproductive, insulting AND wasteful), I will point out that intellectual laziness as dishonesty since you're obviously too intelligent to be stupid."

-Both use the term and actively discuss the concept of agorism and utilize the uncommon use of the word "agorist."

Posted by DPR on October 04, 2012:

"I'm out to turn unconscious agorists in to conscious active ones"

Posted by LS on August 18, 2009:

"If that was so, it would not be possible to be an agorist."

-Both use, spell and hyphenate the word "counter-economics"

Posted by DPR on October 03, 2012:

"but his genius lies in his simple insights he called agorism and counter-economics."

Posted by LS on August 27, 2009"

"Agorism is new libertarian stuff. Counter-economics. Which is black markets, engaging in what is illegal under the state, but is not illegal

Case 1:14-cr-00068-KBF Document 232-4 Filed 04/16/15 Page 8 of 19

in a libertarian sense. This means working for cash and paying no taxes, barter economy, drugs, sex, security etc. Agorism is mostly a theoretical concept."

-Both use the term "the latter"

Posted by DPR on October 01, 2012:

"If I had to choose a side to this question, I think it would be the latter, which might be the first point I've disagreed with Rothbard on"

Posted by LS on March 13, 2011:

"The former is a mistake, the latter everyone has agreed with you 1000 times already Eugene."

-Both frequently capitalize words they want to emphasize

Posted by DPR on April 29, 2012:

"We are NOT beasts of burden to be taxed and controlled and regulated. WE are free spirits! We DEMAND respect!"

Posted by LS on May 28, 2009:

"The free market is a system where one can choose to give up their option to compete and join a commune, but a commune INTERNALLY and BY NATURE cannot tolerate the internal competition necessary to be "free market"."

(Agent's note: As seen by the last two excerpts both subjects began capitalizing words of emphasis in relation to the topic of free markets.)

-Neither uses hyphens to space out sentences or thoughts

(Agent's note: Important point above since many of the other members on the Mises.org forum do use hyphens consistently throughout their posts. These are also member who might have also shared the one or two of the same words or sayings that DPR has used.)

-Both start sentences with "And" and "But" quite often.

Posted by DPR on February 18, 2012:

"But yea, I think with this little tweak, you can do your lottery games and be rewarded for your sales at a level that is more fair."

Posted by DPR on October 21, 2011:

"We are sooooo close to going live again. And I am sooooo exhausted"

Posted by LS on March 17, 2011:

Case 1:14-cr-00068-KBF Document 232-4 Filed 04/16/15 Page 9 of 19

"But Misesian Utilitarians seem to use their position very often to avoid making any statement about ethical or moral values. And I am not afraid to do that." -Both use the saying, "the heart of the matter" Posted by DPR on October 02, 2012: "I think that's a tough pill to swallow for some, but really gets to the heart of the matter" Posted by LS on January 01, 2010: "Penetrating questions. Right to the heart of the matter." -Both use the term "altruistic" Posted by DPR on August 01, 2012: "Those ends can be altruistic if that individual wishes it." Posted by LS on June 01, 2009: "You are welcome to be as altruistic as you like." -Both use the term "pal" UC Chat by DPR: "awww, I've missed you too pal." Posted by LS on September 15, 2009: "Your pal Mitt Romney was not a limited government candidate." -Both use the term "war mongering" Posted by DPR on March 20, 2012: "How can you plug yourself into the tax eating, life sucking, violent, sadistic, war mongering, oppressive machine ever again?" Posted by LS on May 23, 2009: "Even the LP supports war mongering." -Both use the word "phoney" Posted by DPR on January 09, 2012: "With this change, there are no phoney excuses whatsoever for vendors to ask for out of escrow payment." Posted by LS on September 13, 2009:

Case 1:14-cr-00068-KBF Document 232-4 Filed 04/16/15 Page 10 of 19

"I thought you were making a point about phoney taste testing." -Both discuss and debate the authors Rothbard and Konkin -Both commonly end sentences with a smilie face or the smilie face with a wink UC chat with DPR: "I hope you are well :)" "some of your charm ;)" "too busy :)" "I will :)" Posted by LS on April 19, 2011: "George, since you started posting here, you have kinda won me over, but it certainly wasn't due to your bedside manner. :)" Posted by LS on April 18, 2011: "Welcome to Mises. :)" -Both call others "amigo" UC Chats with DPR: "Thanks for accommodating amigo :) Posted by LS on May 04, 2009: "Thank you amigo!" -Both use the term "anarcho-capitalist" Posted by DPR on March 20, 2012: "I'm talking about the Austrian Economic theory, voluntaryism, anarchocapitalism, agorism etc. espoused by the likes of Mises and Rothbard before their deaths, and Salerno and Rockwell today." Posted by LS on April 15, 2009: "If you don't understand a free market, or try to pigeon hole a free market by trying to replace today's institutions straight up for private institutions, then you're not going to be able to appreciate the upside of anarcho-capitalism." -Both misspell the words "a lot" as "alot" Posted by DPR on February 19, 2012:

Case 1:14-cr-00068-KBF Document 232-4 Filed 04/16/15 Page 11 of 19

"That's alot of positive responses! Also, lots of great additional suggestions. We could do alot to improve the feedback system, but for now it looks like this small change has lots of support, so we'll go ahead with it."

Posted by LS on June 15, 2010:

"If you can't articulate your own position clearly in a paragraph or less, then there isn't alot of value in my conversing with you."

-Both use the curse word "bullshit"

Posted by DPR on May 02, 2012:

"This isn't utopian bullshit either."

Posted by LS on May 05, 2011:

``Epistemology does get in the way of bullshit conclusions, which is why many people abandon it."

-Both use similar sayings about "hedge your bet" or "hedge our bets"

UC Chat with DPR"

"and you can continue to do so or not once you are up and running? Hedge your bets"

Posted by LS on May 04, 2009:

"In order to engage in risky ventures (like driving) many of us will need a way to hedge our bets that we won't cause damage beyond our means to pay."

-Both use the cliche of not touching something with a "10 foot pole"

UC Chat with DPR:

"is not something I would touch with a 10 foot pole."

Posted by LS on September 18, 2010:

"This is what the OP and strangeloop will not touch with a 10 foot pole via a clear definition for the term."

-Both commonly use the slang "kinda"

Posted by DPR on October 11, 2012:

"Kinda opens a can of worms about the state's role in national security."

Posted by LS on April 19, 2011:

"George, since you started posting here, you have kinda won me over, but it certainly wasn't due to your bedside manner. :)"

-Both actively have discussed the topic of bitcoins

(Agent's Note: While observing the Mises.org forums it would seem that at face value almost anyone there could easily be DPR. Even a few dozen members had used a few of the same things mentioned above. Yet a closer look at most of them will show that they are nothing like DPR. Besides LS, none of them even matched more than 3 of the words/ sayings listed above. Often times they would use one of the more common words used by DPR, but they never talked about DPR's main inspirations, writers Murray Rothbard, and Samuel Konkin.

This connection was made based upon the all the important aspects of DPR's writing matching LS, to include many unusual words and sayings, which were interestingly located at the same place that both DPR and LS are affiliated to.)

HSI SA Der-Yeghiayan also searched the Mises.org forum and all of LS's posts that could reveal any specific details about LS's true identity. SA Der-Yeghiayan noticed that LS never ended any of his posts with a name, nor did it appear that any other member ever addressed LS with anything but their screen name.

SA Der-Yeghiayan did find the following information in various posts made by LS.

"I live near these landmarks.

http://www.forgottendetroit.com/mcs/index.html

http://www.forgottendetroit.com/national/history.html

http://www.forgottendetroit.com/metropolitan/history.html"

"NZ is a cool spot. Lived there for a couple years, would take it over Canada in a second. Quite fond of Whangarei."

"I have lived with Muslims, I have been in mosques for prayers, and I have observed Ramadan. I have been around a madrasa, and I have spent time asking an Imam questions about his faith. I think I have a clue or two about Islam. I'd hazard a guess I know a hell of a lot more about Islam than you do. Not that it is relevant, but since you continue to make fallacious appeals and ignore the meat of the argument, I'll play your little authority game and raise the level of play.

Good luck finding any Muslim today who follows the Quran precisely, good luck finding more than a handful of Muslims who agree upon what the Quran says and how it should be interpreted. I'm tired of you not substantiating your claims, and continuing to assert you're right. If the best you have are logical fallacies and denial of your own biases, then this conversation is stillborn." "You're in luck here. We have people who have lived, or are from Europe including England, and Canada, and the former Soviet Union, and you can find out lots of first hand experiences. For example, I am a Canadian. And I would not wish our health care system on my enemy."

"Nice to see another Canadian waking up, and in the best way possible."

"I moved around a lot, and changed schools 8 times from Montessori to University (dropped out). School is almost completely indoctrination. I have made the most progress in my life, when my education was selfdirected."

"I dropped out of university 3 months into a BComm."

"I also unschooled myself. It helped having parents who were too busy to keep me in the system."

"http://faculty.msb.edu/hasnasj/GTWebSite/MythWeb.htm I am not studying law, but it is important to point out that the law is arbitrary, and thus support for the state can only be arbitrary."

"Particularly in doing anything in IT, by the time you reach the 3rd year of your degree, a good portion of the course load may be outdated. I work online, and probably spend 15 hours a week keeping up with industry developments. I'm pretty sure this will be the model going forward. People having to upgrade as they work, or risk their productive advantage wiped out through obselence."

"I've started looking into bitcoin and it is pretty interesting. Bitcoin supporters would do well not to be so defensive about it, as they are working against spreading the idea with such an approach."

The next quote was posted on April 15, 2011:

"I don't use Ubuntu on the desktop, but I have a fair bit of Linux experience with servers. This stuff has come a long way since I bought a retail copy of Mandrake 10 years ago."

"I ran Fedora a couple years ago, but an upgrade broke it, and I couldn't be bothered to fix it because I am on a dual boot system and I can't afford to muck up my primary Windows install. I've installed Ubuntu several times since, becoming increasingly pleased with the hardware support, but never really getting into using the system very much. Anyone complaining about Linux h/w support now should have been around 10 years ago."

"I'm always connected. Most people with broadband are. When the net goes down, about once or twice a year for a couple hours, I go lay down and take a nap. My net connectivity is usually very robust. The benefits are that when I come to your house, I can access my data. When I travel, I can access my data without carrying a local copy with me. I don't even need to carry a computer with me. I only need to find one with a net connect, and it doesn't matter what OS it is running or what software it has installed. There are downsides. Security. Redundancy. But everything in life has ups and downs, my point is that for most people, the downs are not as mission critical to what they are doing. There is a pretty good chance Gmail and Facebook keep very good backups, dare I say, better backups than most people keep locally"

"I run 00 locally. But you could easily use Google Documents (or any of another number of document services) to do the very same thing online. Your connection is slow, but 10 years ago I was also on dialup, and now I have a 5mBit line. In another 10 years, 24/7 broadband access EVERYWHERE will be taken for granted. I understand today, (as I am surrounded by 4 PCs) the PC is still the king of the jungle, but I can see no reason why that will be so a decade from now."

"There is one other problem with changing. There is an investment into learning Linux and adapting my Windows usage models. As time goes on, I have less and less free time (or rather time I would invest in this). I have 4 computers at my desk. I will have to switch one and start playing with it to slowly get comfortable. In fact, I think I will start today."

"I use Open Office and Linux, and I do not have the skills to create either. In fact, there are 100s of thousands (if not millions) of people in a similar situation. Your claims about the market don't even pass the most basic evidence or a quick test of reality. Linux is produced under a division of labor, and true market anarchy. It is designed, tested and deployed in a decentralized fashion, adopting temporary heirarchies as necessary along the way, with no prevailing hierarchy permanently entrenched at the top."

"Speak for yourself. I'm pretty awesome. Then again, I am half asian."

"I am self-employed, so I am a self-owner."

The next quote was posted March 14, 2011:

"Ron Paul ain't just for young people! I'm in my mid-30s. :)"

The next quote was posted May 08, 2011"

"I quit smoking 3 years ago."

"I have two horror stores, mine and that of a very close family member. The people who defend the Canadian health care scheme are typically those who don't use it, and those who are dependent on it."

"My friend, I am a few klicks north of you. I love Detroit. It will not have a small government renaissance. I admire your optimism however. You can't starve the beast. That doesn't actually work. You have to lose popular support for the government.

Case 1:14-cr-00068-KBF Document 232-4 Filed 04/16/15 Page 15 of 19

The people of Detroit keep looking to messiahs like Bing, or Kilpatrick, or Young for solutions. As long as they do that, the government will simply be a parasite hibernating until there is something new to feed off."

"We should go for Coney Dogs sometime. But first I have to get a passport so I can cross the Ambassador. All hail the security state!"

 $^{\rm v}{\rm Ok},$ Auburn Hills is not Detroit, but include the Pistons and Shock too. :)"

"Perhaps. My father was one of 7 kids. I have about 20 cousins between both sides. My grandparents helped raise me while my parents worked. My parents helped maintain my grandparents when they got old. I was expected during summer vacations to take my grandfather for walks. I support my parents now when I can and when they need it. As they get older, I will expect to help them further. My sister keeps me on speed dial if she needs help. Is it because I am male? or because I am a useful fellow? She's quite the feminist, but more than happy to let me lift the heavy stuff or pay a bill."

"Sell them. My sister knows a guy who plays WOW with bots, and sells the high level characters on ebay. He drives a sports car. Lol"

The next quote was posted July 02, 2011:

"Also, before anyone starts any conspiracy theories, I am going to have my account here deleted. So if this post goes missing or set to guest, it was by intention."

The next quote was posted July 03, 2011:

"I am done here. I thought it would be deleted by now, but I might wait another day and do it myself.

I don't really write for libertarians anymore. I was never very good at it. If you see "DixieFlatline" around, that's me. I intend to write about business from an Austrian perspective at some point, but it won't be ideological. Anyone who wants to reach me, use the contact info at notreason.com Last post. Auf wiedersehen.

(Edit: of the irony that it is broken due to the POS rich text editor.)"

"I have made a post here explaining how to get some of this functionality back. http://notreason.com/mises-community-quote-workaround/ Let me know if pictures would be helpful. If you have any questions, ask here. Big thanks to Nir for helping make this happen."

Using all the information listed above SA Der-Yeghiayan was able to conclude that LS was a non-white half-Asian male in his mid-30's who resides or resided in Canada. He grew up in New Zealand, and has a

Case 1:14-cr-00068-KBF Document 232-4 Filed 04/16/15 Page 16 of 19

"feminist" sister. He dropped out of college while pursuing a degree in perhaps Business Commerce. He has an advanced, self-educated knowledge of computers and networking. He possibly lives or has lived near Detroit, close to the Ambassador Bridge, and follows American sports teams such as the Detroit Pistons, and maybe without a passport. He uses another username "dixieFlatline", and forwarded others seeking him to notreason.com.

On or around November of 2012, SA Der-Yeghiayan conducted several open database searches on notreason.com and discovered that the website was still active and was registered on July 17, 2008 through GoDaddy. With exception of one month, all of its WHOIS information had been protected by Domains by Proxy.

The July 14, 2009 WHOIS registration remained unprotected and was filed pubilically, and showed that the registrant was Autodeletepro located at 105 - 2940 Elsmere Court, Windsor, Ontario N8X 5A9, Canada. The administrator and technical contact was listed as Athavale, Anand, with the email address sales AT adpmods.com, Autodeletepro, which was located at 105 - 2940 Elsmere Court, Windsor, Ontario N8X 5A9, Canada and telephone number (519) 250-9021. The servers for the website were controlled by the company Hostgator.

SA Der-Yeghiayan conducted additional research on the website and noticed that it was originally hosted at Internet Protocol (IP) address 74.53.81.66 but on May 28, 2011 it switched to IP address 184.173.203.97.

Running a reverse lookup on IP 184.173.203.97 showed 112 other websites located on that IP. Majority of those websites WHOIS information were protected.

SA Der-Yeghiayan sent several Title 21 administrative subpoenas to companies such as GoDaddy, Hostgator and WhoisGuard for subscriber information related to the notreason.com website.

SA Der-Yeghiayan also conducted several searches in law enforcement databases and found a traveler with the name ATHAVALE, Anand Nathan, who was a Canadian Citizen, with the date of birth (DOB) November 01, 1975 who had traveled over the Ambassador bridge on August 11, 2005, and had travel as early as January 11, 1997, arriving inbound from Auckland, New Zealand into Honolulu, HI bearing Canadian Passport VD084114.

SA Der-Yeghiayan was also able to find a Canadian driver's license for ATHAVALE showing he resided at 2739 Parent Ave, Windsor, ON, CA. SA Der-Yeghiayan also discovered a more current Canadian driver's license with the address 3733 Edgehill Dr, PO Box 87, Tappen, BC CA.

All three subpoenas returns were eventually received and showed that Anand ATHAVALE with the same addresses listed above, registered, owned, protected and administered the notreason.com website.

SA Der-Yeghiayan found a website registered and operated by ATHAVALE by the name of anitaathavale.com. SA Der-Yeghiayan was able to identify her as Anita Genevieve Athavale, Canadian citizen, with the DOB of June 21, 1978, bearing an active Canadian passport #WK180678. ATHAVALE maintains several websites for Anita, including a yoga website.

While conducting open database searches on Anita, SA Der-Yeghiayan found an article that showed her as being one of Canada's most gifted singer songwriter. The article went on to say the following:

"Born in Windsor, Ontario, Anita Athavale was the child of entrepreneurs and music lovers. The daughter of a mother with German/Czech heritage and a father from India, Anita was drenched in cultural richness and determination from the get-go. Her parent's mixed-culture marriage became strained over time and in an effort to reconcile, the family moved to New Zealand for a fresh start. Living abroad in her early teens, Anita found an opportunity to pursue her secret interest in singing and performing.

Eventually her parents decided to divorce and Anita returned to Canada with her brother and mother. Dealing with her family turmoil, Anita more certainly felt the need to find an avenue for expression. When she turned sixteen, Anita began performing a mix of covers and original songs on open stages and in coffee-houses. Within months of her debut performance, she had garnered enough attention to be offered opening slots for Canadian major label acts."

(Agent's note: This paragraph helps fill in the gaps about LS. His father is from India, and mother is from German/Czech background, which is why he calls himself half-Asian. It also fits in to see why he says he was traveling around so much and was in an out of a lot of schools. This also explains how he grew up partly in New Zealand.)

Based on this information SA Der-Yeghiayan placed a record on Anita to be alerted of any travel associated to the United States.

On March 08, 2013, Anita traveled through pre-clearance at Calgary International airport in destination of Hawaii. Customs and Border Protection (CBP) officers stopped Anita and conducted an enforcement examine. SA Der-Yeghiayan was requesting that the officers attempt to gather any information about her association and the location of her brother.

CBP Officers reported that Anita was on her way to a yoga retreat in Hawaii and was traveling alone. The officers stated that she currently resides at 720 2nd Ave NW Apt 307, in Calgary AB T2N0E3. She is a yoga instructor and works for Bodhi Tree yoga here in Calgary.

She provided the officers a couple of email addresses, such as anitagenevieve AT gmail.com, tootsiewootz AT gmail.com, unifyyoga AT gmail.com and anitaathavlemusic AT gmail.com. They stated that her brother Anand lives with her mom Gwen and step dad Brian KRIVASHEIN in BC. Their address is 3733 Edgehill DR, Tappen BC V0E2X1. The telephone number she had listed on her phone for her brother was 250-515-6180. Her current Canadian passport number is QH98637.

SA Der-Yeghiayan also discovered through open database searches that ATHAVALE administers and operates a Detroit Pistons forum under the

username Roscoe36. The website is pistonsforum.com. On March 31, 2011, he posted the following:

"I have been East Coast, even when I lived on the West Coast. I am now moving to the West Coast, where I plan to be West Coast for the rest of my life."

Another member asked him where and he responded, "4 hours give or take north of Seattle."

(Agent's note: There are several key points to make about LS and his activity, as well as DPR. On the Mises.org forum he was active from 2009 up until early July of 2011. Then in May of 2011 he suddenly stops posting until he reappeared in July to make several final posts to inform members of his departure from the site. During his time on the Mises.org forums he produced over 11,000 posts. Then, all of a sudden he tells everyone he's leaving and vanishes.

The timing is interesting in that the Silk Road began in March of 2011, and then became enormously popular after an article broke about the website's existence in early June of 2011. This is around the same time it appears he decided to leave his home in Windsor and move into his mother's home in a remote location north of Vancouver.

It also appears as if ATHAVALE was a computer administrator for multiple websites, yet most of them he doesn't operate anymore. It is unknown as to how he's sustaining himself. The cost of the servers he owns and his other active websites are costly and have expensive monthly bills. It is unknown as to how ATHAVALE is supporting himself and his current lifestyle.

Another unique observation between DPR and ATHAVALE is that they both seem to write to the level of their reader. Looking at the UC chats between DPR and the UC Agent look nothing like the posting made on the SR forum. It shows that DPR is cognizant of his/her audience. The posts on the Silk Road forums are careful and time is spent to not reveal too much about his/her identity. The sentence structure is near perfect, and his/her spelling is nearly without flaws. The paragraphs and thoughts are spaced out correctly, and grammatically it appears as if DPR possesses a graduate level degree. Yet, once in the UC chats he/she appears relaxed but his/her grammar resembles that of a high school graduate. One could think the two could never be one in the same.

The same is seen in ATHAVALE. On the Mises.org forums his posts were thought out, conscientious and cognizant of his audience. ATHAVALE used his notreason.com website to post blogs under the username dixieflatline. There it appears he felt he was weighed more by other so his writing skills increased to that of again graduate level education. Yet, once you read his posts under the username Roscoe36 on the Detroit Pistons forum you would never think the two people could ever be the same.

ATHAVALE has demonstrated the ability to be able to play the part of multiple identities online. His timing of activity and departure from not only the forums he occupied for so long, but also his home correspond very closely with the rise of the Silk Road. He has the computer skills and knowledge to able to operate the Silk Road in the manner in which it appears DPR does.)

The HSI investigation continues.